

of Iran as a major Sunni hub between South Asia and the Arab Middle East. Philippon's work identifies institutions which bring Pakistani Sufism to the Gulf. Her survey explores the origins of three Sufi institutions and examines the extension of religious practices through accounts of leaders and organizers of social activities and *dhikr* circles. In these accounts, South Asia is the source of new leaders, pedagogies and institutions of religious practice.

This important volume brings together a cohort of scholars specializing in the region. As the editors point out in their conclusion, the contributors offer highly original and well researched insights into important topics of study in South Asian Islam including Wahhabism, Sunnism, Shi'ism, the Ahl-i Hadith, Deobandis, the Afghan jihad, madrasas and sectarianism. They also set out agendas and methodologies relevant to the study of Islamic transnationalism in general.

Sana Haroon

University of Massachusetts Boston

E-mail: Sana.Haroon@umb.edu

doi:10.1093/jis/etz016

Published online 25 March 2019

Islam and Colonialism: Becoming Modern in Indonesia and Malaya

By MUHAMAD ALI (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2016),
xxi + 335 pp. Price HB £75.00. EAN 978-1474409209.

Edward Said's most famous work, *Orientalism* (first published in 1978), attained blockbuster status and provided the impetus for increasing recrimination leveled by formerly colonized communities against the perceived rapacious policies of European colonial powers. In this present book, Muhamad Ali reminds us at different points of some of Said's charges against the colonial powers. First, Said claimed that the goal of colonial education was to promote European history and to 'demote the native history' (p. 256). Second, colonizing powers set out to establish a hegemony of colonial educational ideas and institutions over Islamic and indigenous traditions of learning. And third, the effect of Western colonial modernization was to destroy Islam and local customs.

In this context, this new book by Muhamad Ali is refreshingly original, providing a long-overdue response to aspects of Said's overly polemical treatise, though Ali's response to Said is sporadic, measured and highly nuanced. Ali does not see the colonized-colonizer relationship as a simple struggle between the forces for good and the forces for evil respectively. Rather, through meticulous research, Ali paints a complex and highly variegated portrait of his chosen subject matter.

Given the tsunami of anti-colonialism scholarship since the appearance of Said's *Orientalism*, today's readers cannot fail to be surprised by daring statements as early as the first page of this new book, where Ali says 'Islam and colonialism were not as confrontational as is often assumed'. This serves as a

herald of the discussion to follow, signaling that black/white distinctions might feed populist appetites but historical rigour necessitates a recognition of many shades of grey.

The introduction sets the scene, moving quickly to provide an extensive list of areas where European colonialism and Islamic reform effectively supported each other, even if unintentionally (p. 2). Ali also reveals the architecture of his book, structured according to pairs: European colonialism interwoven with Islamic reform; the Netherlands East Indies (NEI) interwoven with British Malaya; the Dutch colonizers interwoven with the British; and in more focused discussion South Sulawesi is interwoven with Kelantan. Also appearing in the introduction are helpful definitions of key terms: modernization, modernity, Islamization, secularization and so forth.

Part 1, comprising the first two chapters, traces the modernist and traditionalist reform efforts in the NEI and Malaya. While Indonesians addressed Islamic reform through mass organizations—Muhammadiyah and Nahdhatul Ulama—Malays depended more on publications to move the reformist agenda forward. The discussion includes valuable biographical information on key actors on the Islamic stage in the Malay-Indonesian world: Ahmad Dahlan, Hasyim Asy'ari, Tahir Jalaluddin, and Syed Al-Hadi.

Chapter 1 binds the discussion of Indonesia and Malaya together through identification of common threads with interesting differences. Of special value is the author's argument that both traditionalists and reformists were 'agreed on the need for reforming Muslim communities' (p. 69) but differed on the means and methods to do so. This is an advance on the common view that traditionalists and reformists were diametrically opposed in all ways.

In ch. 2, Ali turns to European colonial administrators and scholars, considering such prominent personalities as Christiaan Snouck Hurgronje (1857–1936), Hendrik Kraemer (1888–1965), Richard Wilkinson (1867–1941) and Richard Winstedt (1878–1966). He observes that the Dutch were more concerned with political Islam, while the British more closely addressed cultural aspects. He also points out importantly that the Dutch Ethical Policy (1901) was designed to share the benefits of colonization with the colonized.

In considering the situation in British-governed Malaya, Ali notes that the British were wary of resistance from Muslims, given their Indian experience. Wilkinson and Winstedt reinforced conceptualization of Islam as inseparable from Malay identity. In concluding this chapter, Ali notes that 'There was no unified, monolithic "Orientalism" ' (p. 101). This is a well written and helpful chapter, continuing the dynamic and highly valued comparison of Dutch and British policy and practice, and providing original and helpful comparison and contrast of two leading Dutch and two British colonial scholars.

Part 2 of the book considers matters of politics and government, and comprises the third and fourth chapters. In ch. 3, the author examines Muslim reformist articulation of politics in the NEI and Malaya, as well as their perceptions of the Ottoman Turkish caliphate, the colonial state and the traditional governing systems. He considers the emergence of the first Indonesian Islamic organization

that became a political party, the Sarekat Islam, which played a key role in advancing Islam in Indonesia towards nationhood.

Turning to Malaya, Ali notes that Malays wanted to retain their sultanates but were open to new ideas, with the reformist Kaum Muda becoming increasingly politicized. He cites personalities such as Zainal Abidin bin Ahmad (Za'ba), Tok Kenali and Tahir Jalaluddin who, while expressing some reservations about British rule, were willing to work with it in various ways for mutual benefit.

In this chapter certain features come through clearly and helpfully: political parties in Indonesia; periodicals and cultural clubs in Malaya; the argument that increasing political consciousness did not necessarily translate to automatic anti-colonial sentiment, and in some cases the reverse; the lack of clarity reflecting the search for political identity and meaning among diverse thinkers, which fits with developments elsewhere in the Muslim world in the early decades of the twentieth century.

In ch. 4, we learn how changes in systems of government, combined with diverse interpretations of politics by Muslims, produced eclectic, hybrid governing systems in the NEI and Malaya. Ali notes how secularization through differentiation of domains of life occurred in both colonized regions, facilitated in particular by the growth of bureaucracies.

In Malaya, the British allowed sultans and the religious scholars and leaders to largely regulate Islamic orthodoxy and orthopraxy.

Part 3 turns to matters of law and its modernization. Chapter 5 shows how Muslim reformers and religious authorities expanded shari'a beyond the traditional elements of *fiqh* and legal opinions (*fatāwā*) to also take account of local custom (*adat*) and Western colonial law. Muslim reformers in Indonesia focused activities on mosques, schools and religious associations rather than the court system, which they saw as belonging to the Dutch and native aristocracy. Meanwhile, Malays did not reject the British secular legal system provided they could preserve Islam and customary laws.

This chapter foregrounds the author's argument against any simplistic portrayal which pits reformist Muslims against colonial authorities in the domain of law. In all four regions considered (Java, South Sulawesi, Malaya, Kelantan) there was a subtle balance and at times cooperation between the two, with lasting consequences in terms of the tripartite division between secular, Islamic and customary legal systems.

Chapter 6 considers colonial interpretation of laws and attempts to standardize legal institutions in the colonies, with resulting influence on local Muslim understanding and practice of law. Certain Dutch and British scholars formalized and differentiated between civil common law, shari'a, and *adat* customary law. But Dutch scholarly opinion was divided, with anthropologists favouring the preservation of *adat*, and Islamologues (such as Snouck Hurgronje) focusing on shari'a.

Concerning South Sulawesi, Ali notes that 'European colonial administrators and Muslim reformers came from different backgrounds and often conflicted with each other on the notions of rationality and modernity, but they had parallel desires to establish their ideas of justice and to ensure social order' (p. 217).

Such nuanced comment is extremely helpful and puts paid to claims that colonial officials and Muslim reformers were at loggerheads on every single issue. Nevertheless, there is still a tendency—that harks back to the pervasive influence of Edward Said—to see colonial writers as objects to study who were likely to have biased perspectives, rather than being sources of reliable information. For example, reference by colonial writers to piracy and kidnapping by some Malays (p. 206) is unlikely to have been invented, as seen in the practice of piracy in some parts of the Southern Philippines today. Similarly, critical comments on aspects of Islamic interpretation by colonial officials (*passim*) is not presented as credible in any way in this volume, yet the intra-Muslim debates reported by the author suggest that such colonial critiques may well have resonated to some extent with the perspectives of some Muslims themselves.

Part 4 considers matters of education. Chapter 7 addresses affairs of religion and the secular in the context of education. Ali notes (p. 223): ‘The goal of Muslim education was not to re-establish the Islamic caliphate or promote Islamic political unity; the goal was to encourage people in the East Indies and in Malaya to be “better Muslims” by teaching, *ta’lim* or *pengajaran*.’ The rich discussion of debates about pedagogical methods and approaches between traditionalists, reformists and the intersection with colonial educational systems, reflects the delicate interplay between religious instruction and the growing influence of non-religious teaching in the new school systems established by reformists.

Chapter 8 considers colonial approaches toward European, vernacular, Arabic, and Islamic education in the NEI and Malaya. Ali is at pains to stress the complexity of policy, noting ‘There were [*sic*] thus a diversity of discourses and policies among colonial scholars and administrators in their dealings with Western education and with vernacular and Islamic education’ (p. 257). He points out the commitment of colonial authorities to vernacular education, citing Sulawesi as an example of growth in this area, with 29 native schools and 95 village schools functioning in 1910, a figure that grew to 750 vernacular schools by 1936 (p. 259).

A clear strength of this work is that it provides the kind of nuance that Edward Said’s approach lacked. When Said suggested that the purposes of colonial education was to promote European history and to ‘demote the native history’, Ali responds that ‘Europeans expressed a variety of educational goals, stating that an education assisted people in “pursuing happiness” or “fulfilling the powers of the individual mind”, but that it should also “fit the needs of the community” and “help create a better society”’ (p. 256).

Responding further to Edward Said by implication, Ali writes ‘the relationship is not merely about destruction. . . Europeans did not always attempt to destroy Asians and their histories and cultures’ (p. 288).

This book also reminds us of the importance of taking a broad view of the Malay-Indonesian world, not limiting ourselves to colonial boundaries. I took my undergraduate degree in the University of Sydney’s Department of Indonesian and Malay Studies, a structure that reflected a recognition of the commonalities between the Malay Peninsula and the Indonesian archipelago that is often

neglected. Can one become an Indonesianist without also being sensitized to developments across the Straits of Malacca and the Java Sea? Muhamad Ali's study suggests not, given both the extensive commonalities and dynamic differences between the two regions.

Ali's book is an excellent piece of research that should be read by anyone interested in the modern history of Indonesia and Malaysia.

Peter G. Riddell

Melbourne School of Theology and History, and SOAS University of London

E-mail: peter_riddell@yahoo.com

doi:10.1093/jis/etz026

Published online 4 June 2019

Imams in Western Europe: Developments, Transformations, and Institutional Challenges

Edited by MOHAMMED HASHAS, JAN JAAP DE RUITER and NIELS VALDEMAR VINDING (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2018), 438 pp. Price HB €129.00. EAN 978–9462983830.

This book offers a diverse collection of papers covering different aspects of religious leadership and the institutionalization of Islam in Europe. It is the outcome of a collaborative effort between Mohammed Hashas, Jan Jaap de Ruiter, Niels Valdemar Vinding and Khalid Hajji who organized an international conference in 2014 at LUISS Guido Carli University and Cabot University in Rome gathering scholars from various disciplines to discuss the current developments and transformations of the role of imams in Europe. As is usually the case for books that emanate from international conferences/workshops, *Imams in Western Europe* aims to cover all aspects of the subject. While the title suggests imams as the main focus, as does the objective set by the editors at the beginning ('to explore the role, function, and position of imams and the implications of the imamate as a religious-institutional authority in Western Europe' [p. 25]), the papers also study other actors in the Muslim socio-religious field, from women jihadis to ordinary Muslims.

The book is divided into two untitled parts, containing 21 papers. In the absence of a formal introduction, the first paper authored by the three editors serves that function. The division of the papers into two inconsistent parts—one theoretical, the other empirical—seems both confused and confusing. The editors (p. 29) consider Göran Larsson's paper on the Swedish case and Welmoet Boender and Jan Jaap de Ruiter's paper on the Dutch as if these were situated in the 'empirical' part whereas they are in the first 'theoretical' part. Moreover, some contributions figuring in the first part are empirical, such as that of Jouanneau, Boender and de Ruiter, and Carvailho, while others in the second part could be considered as theoretical although based on fieldwork, such as Niels Valdemar Vinding's paper.